

BY SPEED POST

No.U.12012/134/2015-ME - I [3114018]

Government of India

Ministry of Health & Family Welfare

(Department of Health & Family Welfare)

Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi-11

Dated the 30th August, 2017.

ORDER

Subject: Recognition/approval of Major S .D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted Chhatrapati Sahuji Maharaj University, Kanpur by u/s 11(2) of the I.M.C. Act, 1956- reg.

Whereas the Major S .D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh made application for recognition/approval of MBBS students (100 seats) being trained at the College u/s 11(2) of IMC Act, 1956 to the Ministry of Health & Family Welfare. The request was forwarded to the Medical Council of India (MCI);

2. Whereas the MCI conducted assessment of the college on (2nd March, 2016 and 6th & 7th April, 2016) and the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 13.05.2016 considered the assessment reports ((2nd March, 2016 and 6th & 7th April, 2016)) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 70.75 % as detailed in the report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 89.55 % as detailed in the report.
3. Medical Superintendent Dr. C.S. Aggarwal was not available on both days of assessment.
4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 552 against requirement of 800.
5. Bed occupancy was 24.46 % on day of assessment.
6. There was NIL Major operation & 02 Minor operations on day of assessment.
7. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
8. CT Scan is not functional.
9. Workload of Special investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
10. Radiological investigation workload is grossly inadequate.
11. Histopathology workload was only 03 & Cytopathological workload was only 04 on day of assessment.
12. Labour Room: Labour Register is not available. There is no sister i/c.
13. Radiodiagnosis Department: Only 2 mobile X-ray machines are available against requirement of 4. Only 3 static X-ray machines are available against requirement of 5. Only 2 USG machines are available against requirement of 3.
14. OPD: Plaster room & Plaster Cutting Room are common. Cancer Detection clinic is non-functional.
15. Casualty: Reception counter in Casualty is non-functional and laden with dust.
16. MRD: Staff is inadequate.
17. Wards of Tb & Chest, Skin & VD & Psychiatry are common for males & females.

18. CSSD: Staff is not adequate. I/c Nurse/Technician is not available.
19. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned. Students' reading Room (Inside) Reading Room, Residents' reading Rooms are not airconditioned. Internet connection is not available.
20. Central Photography Section is not functional.
21. Students' Hostels: Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
22. Interns' Hostel: Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
23. Residents' Hostel: Visitors' room, A.C. Study room with Computer & Internet, Recreation room are not available.
24. Canteen facilities are inadequate.
25. Anatomy Department: Specimens available are only 80. Cadavers are not available. Capacity of cold storage for dead bodies is inadequate.
26. Pathology department: Only 80 specimens are available.
27. Microbiology Department: Only 1 Service Laboratory is available against requirement of 7.
28. Community Medicine Department: Demonstration room has capacity of only 30 which is inadequate.
29. RHTC: It is non-functional. It is just labeled & located in a college campus. There are no clinical, survey, Immunization, family welfare or National Health Programme activities. No record is available.
30. UHC: It is not available. A private nursing home was shown as UHC which is not permissible. No manpower is available. There are no clinical, survey, Immunization, family welfare or National Health Programme activities. There is no record.

In view of the above, the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Government not to recognise/approve Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fathegarh, Farrukhabad, for the award of MBBS degree granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956 and further decided that the Institute be asked to submit the compliance for rectification of the above deficiencies within 01 month for further consideration of the matter.

Further the Executive Committee of the Council decided to recommend to the Central Govt. not to renew the permission for admission of freshbatch of 150 MBBS students at Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fathegarh, Farrukhabad, under Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur, u/s 10A of the IMC Act, 1956 for the academic year 2016-2017.

3. Whereas, based on the above, the MCI vide letter dated 15.05.2016 recommended the Central Govt. not to renew permission for admission of fresh batch of 150 MBBS students at Major S.D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh for the academic session 2016-17;

Q

4. Whereas the Ministry accepted the recommendation of MCI and issued letter dated 10.06.2016 directing the College not to take admission in fresh batch (100 seats) in MBBS course at **Major S .D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh** for the academic session 2016-17;

5. Whereas on Oversight Committee (OC) directive, the Ministry obtained compliance from the college afresh and forwarded it to MCI. MCI returned the compliance citing various reasons. **Ministry forwarded the reply of MCI to OC.**

6. Whereas the compliance verification assessment for recognition of the College u/s 11(2) of **IMC Act, 1956** conducted on 6th-7th April, 2016 & 19th July, 2016 and the Executive Committee of the Council at its meeting held on 23.8.2016 considered the assessment reports (19th July, 2016 and 6th & 7th April, 2016) and noted the following:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 72.4 % as detailed in report.
2. Shortage of Residents is 88.05 % as detailed in the report.
3. Both Dean Dr. Suresh Prasad & Medical Superintendent Dr. C.S. Agarwal were **not available** on day of assessment.
4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 318 against requirement of 800.
5. Hospital is practically non-functional since 11/07/2016.
6. Bed Occupancy was only 5 % on day of assessment. All the wards wore deserted look. There were no patients in many wards.
7. Occupancy in Intensive Care Units was NIL on day of assessment.
8. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment. Last operation was done on 11/07/2016.
9. There was NIL Normal Delivery & Nil Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
10. CT Scan was not functional on day of assessment.
11. Workload of Special Investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment.
12. Radiological investigation workload is grossly inadequate.
13. Laboratory investigation workload is NIL on day of assessment.
14. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment. No record was available regarding samples under process in Histopathology laboratory.
15. Available USG machines are 2 against requirement of 3.
16. OPD: Colposcope is not available.
17. Casualty: There was NIL patient in Casualty.
18. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned.
19. Canteen facilities are inadequate.
20. Anatomy department: Available specimens are only 56. Capacity of cold storage bodies is not adequate.
21. Pathology department: Available specimens are only 63.
22. Microbiology department: All service laboratories are non-functional.
23. RHTC: It is partially functional. There is no clinical, Survey, Immunization, family Welfare & National Health Programmes. No record is available.
24. There was no display of name of Dean outside his office.

R

7. Whereas Oversight Committee (OC) approved the conditional recognition of the Major S .D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh and the Central Government on the approval of the OC issued necessary notification on 12.09.2016 for recognition of the College (100 students) with conditions imposed by the OC;

8. Whereas as per the conditions laid down in the conditional notification an compliance verification assessment was carried out by the Council's assessors on 21st February, 2017 of the College.

9. Whereas, the assessment report (21st February, 2017) was considered by the Executive Committee of MCI at its meeting held on 21.03.2017 and noted the following deficiencies:-

1. Deficiency of faculty is 72.4 % as detailed in the report.
2. Medical Superintendent has crossed age of 70 y; hence not eligible to hold the post.
3. Shortage of Residents is 88.05 % as detailed in the report.
4. Bed Occupancy at 10 a.m. on day of assessment is 20.85 %.
5. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor assessment on day of assessment. There was NIL Major Operation after 17/02/2017.
6. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.
7. Workload of plain X-rays for indoor patients is NIL on day of assessment.
8. Details of tests conducted in service laboratories of Microbiology were not provided.
9. There was NIL patient in Casualty on day of assessment.
10. CT Scan is not functional.
11. Wards of Tb & Chest, Psychiatry and Skin & VD are common for males/females. There were NIL patients in these wards on day of assessment. Deficiency remains as it is.
12. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned. Only 12 Internet Nodes are available. Deficiency remains as it is.
13. Students' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet.
14. Interns' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet. Recreation room is not available.
15. Residents' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet.
16. Canteen: Although infrastructure is available, presently canteen services are not available.
17. RHTC: Details not provided. Faculty from Community Medicine were not present at time of visit.
18. UHC: Details not provided. Faculty from Community Medicine were not present at time of visit.

10. Whereas, the MCI vide letter dated 24.03.2017 has informed and recommended to the Ministry as under:

In view of the above, the college has failed to abide by the undertaking it had given to the Central Govt. that there are no deficiencies as per clause 3.2(i) of the directions passed by the Supreme Court mandated Oversight Committee vide communication dated 12/09/2016. The Executive Committee, after due deliberation and discussion decided that the college has failed to comply with the stipulation laid down by the Oversight Committee. Accordingly, the Executive Committee recommends that as per the directions passed by Oversight Committee in para 3.2(b) vide communication dated 12/09/2016 the college should be debarred from admitting students

in the above course for a period of two academic years i.e. 2017-18 & 2018-19 as even after giving an undertaking that they have fulfilled the entire infrastructure for recognition/approval of Major S.D. Singh Medical College and Hospital, Fatehgarh Farrukhabad for the award of MBBS degree (100 seats) granted by Chhatrapati Shahu Ji Maharaj University, Kanpur u/s 11(2) of the IMC Act, 1956, the college was found to be grossly deficient. It has also been decided by the Executive Committee that the Bank Guarantee furnished by the college in pursuance of the directives passed by the Oversight Committee as well as GOI letter dated 12/09/2016 is liable to be encashed.

The Committee further decided to apply of clause 8(3)(1)(c) of Establishment of Medical College Regulation (Amendment),2010(Part II), dated 16th April, 2010 and amended on 18.03.2016.

11. Whereas the Ministry decided to grant a personal hearing to the College on 11.04.2017 by the Hearing Committee. The Hearing Committee after considering the oral and written submission of the College submitted its report to the Ministry. In its report, the Hearing Committee observed as under:

Srl. No.	Deficiencies reported by MCI	Observations of hearing committee
1.	Deficiency of faculty is 72.4 % as detailed in the report.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
2.	Medical Superintendent has crossed age of 70 y; hence not eligible to hold the post.	Reply not satisfactory. MS joined after the MCI inspection. Deficiency persists
3.	Shortage of Residents is 88.05 % as detailed in the report.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
4.	Bed Occupancy at 10 a.m. on day of assessment is 20.85 %.	Comments does not match of column 2 with the first assessment report as the Bed occupancy is 5%. Deficiency persists.
5.	There was NIL Major & NIL Minor assessment on day of assessment. There was NIL Major Operation after 17/02/2017.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
6.	There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.

R

7.	Workload of plain X-rays for indoor patients is NIL on day of assessment.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
8.	Details of tests conducted in service laboratories of Microbiology were not provided.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
9.	There was NIL patient in Casualty on day of assessment.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
10.	CT Scan is not functional.	No dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal. Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists.
11.	Students' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet.	Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists
12.	Interns' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet. Recreation room is not available.	Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists
13.	Residents' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet.	Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists
14.	Canteen: Although infrastructure is available, presently canteen services are not available.	Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists
15.	RHTC: Details not provided. Faculty from Community Medicine were not present at time of visit.	Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists
16.	UHC: Details not provided. Faculty from Community Medicine were not present at time of visit.	Reply not satisfactory. Deficiency persists

12. Whereas the Ministry after considering the recommendation of MCI and Hearing report, decided to debar the Major S .D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh from admitting students for two academic years i.e. 2017-18 & 2018-19 and also authorize the MCI to encash the Bank Guarantee of Rs. 2.00 Crore. Accordingly, the decision was communicated to the College vide Ministry's letter dated 31.05.2017.

13. Whereas the college filed W.P (C) No. 673 of 2017 in the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India challenging the decision of the Ministry dated 31.05.2017 and the Hon'ble Supreme Court gave the following direction on 11.08.2017:-

"Having heard learned counsel for the parties, it is directed that the Central Government shall afford an opportunity of hearing to the representatives of the Institutions and take assistance

2

of the newly constituted Committee as per the judgment passed by the Constitution Bench in Amma Chandravati Educational and Charitable Trust and Others V. Union of India and Another [Writ Petition (C) No. 408 of 2017], within then days hence and pass a reasoned order by end of August, 2017".

14. Now, in compliance with the above direction of Hon'ble Supreme Court dated 11.8.2017, the Ministry granted hearing to the college on 24.8.2017. The representative of the Oversight Committee could not attend the Hearing Committee meeting. The Hearing Committee after considering the record and submission of the college submitted its report to the Ministry. Conclusion of the Hearing Committee are as under:-

"Hearing Committee does not recommend Major SD Singh Medical & Hospital for Renewal/ Recognition".

A Copy of the Hearing Committee report containing their observations is enclosed.

15. Accepting the recommendations of Hearing Committee, the Ministry reiterates earlier decision dated 31.5.2017 to debar the Major S .D. Singh Medical College & Hospital, Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh from admitting students for two academic years i.e. 2017-18 & 2018-19 and also authorize the MCI to encash the Bank Guarantee of Rs. 2.00 Crore.



(D V K Rao)

Under Secretary to the Govt. of India
Telefax: 011-23062959

end: A/A

To

The Principal/Dean,
Major S D Singh Medical College & Hospital,
Seeganpur, Bewar Road, Fatehgarh,
Distt.- Farrukhabad, Uttar Pradesh.

Copy to:

1. The Principal Secretary,(Health & FW), Department of Health & Family Welfare, Govt. of Uttar Pradesh, 5th Floor, Room No.516, Vikas Bhawan, Lucknow-226001 (Uttar Pradesh).
2. The Secretary, Medical Council of India, Pocket-14, Sector-8, Dwarka, New Delhi-75.
3. The Registrár, Chhatrapati Shahuji Maharaj Medical University, Kanpur, Uttar Pradesh.
4. The Director General, Medical Education, Government of Uttar Pradesh, Lucknow, U.P.
5. The ADG (ME), Dte.GHS, Nirman Bhawan, New Delhi

1. Major S.D Singh Medical College & Hospital

2.

Deficiencies 2016-17	Deficiencies in compliance verification after OC approval	Comments of DGHS Hearing Committee	Hearing Committee findings (24.08.2017)
<p>1. Deficiency of faculty is 72.4 % as detailed in report. 2. Shortage of Residents is 88.05 % as detailed in the report. 3. Both Dean Dr. Suresh Prasad & Medical Superintendent Dr. C.S. Agarwal were not available on day of assessment. 4. OPD attendance on day of assessment was 318 against requirement of 800. 5. Hospital is practically non-functional since 11/07/2016. 6. Bed Occupancy was only 5 % on day of assessment. All the wards were deserted look. There were no patients in many wards. 7. Occupancy in Intensive Care Units was NIL on day of assessment. 8. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor operation on day of assessment. Last operation was done on 11/07/2016. 9. There was NIL Normal Delivery & Nil Caesarean Section on day of assessment. 10. CT Scan was not functional on day of assessment. 11. Workload of Special Investigations like Ba, IVP was NIL on day of assessment. 12. Radiological investigation workload is grossly inadequate. 13. Laboratory investigation workload is NIL on day of assessment. 14. Histopathology & Cytopathology workload was NIL on day of assessment. No record was available regarding samples under process in Histopathology laboratory. 15. Available USG machines are 2 against requirement of 3. 16. OPD: Colposcope is not available. 17. Casualty: There was NIL patient in Casualty.</p>	<p>1. Deficiency of faculty is 72.4 % as detailed in the report. 2. Medical Superintendent has crossed age of 70 y; hence not eligible to hold the post. 3. Shortage of Residents is 88.05 % as detailed in the report. 4. Bed Occupancy at 10 a.m. on day of assessment is 20.85 %. 5. There was NIL Major & NIL Minor assessment on day of assessment. There was NIL Major Operation after 17/02/2017. 6. There was NIL Normal Delivery & NIL Caesarean Section on day of assessment. 7. Workload of plain X-rays for indoor patients is NIL on day of assessment. 8. Details of tests conducted in service laboratories of Microbiology were not provided. 9. There was NIL patient in Casualty on day of assessment. 10. CT Scan is not functional. 11. Wards of Tb & Chest, Psychiatry and Skin & VD are common for males/females. There were NIL patients in these wards on day of assessment. Deficiency remains as it is. 12. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned. Only 12 Internet Nodes are available. Deficiency remains as it is. 13. Students' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet.</p>	<p>1. No Dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal Reply not satisfactory Deficiency persists. 2. Reply not satisfactory MS Join after the MCI Inspection. Deficiency persists. 3. No Dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal Reply not satisfactory Deficiency persists. 4. Comments does not match of the column-2 with the first assessment report as bed occupancy is 5% Deficiency persists. 5. No Dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal Reply not satisfactory Deficiency persists. 6. No Dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal Reply not satisfactory Deficiency persists. 7. No Dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal Reply not satisfactory Deficiency persists.</p>	<p>The Points of observation from 1 to 11 by MCI Assessor show gross deficiency of the requirements in terms of Faculty, Residents, bed occupancy, number of major operations, normal delivery /caesarean and infrastructure etc. And the explanation offered is not satisfactory at all. No dissent Note has been submitted by the College authorities to the MCI within the stipulated time.</p>

B.V.S.

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

[Signature]

<p>18. Central Library: It is not fully air-conditioned. 19. Canteen facilities are inadequate. 20. Anatomy department: Available specimens are only 56. Capacity of cold storage bodies is not adequate. 21. Pathology department: Available specimens are only 63. 22. Microbiology department: All service laboratories are non-functional. 23. RHTC: It is partially functional. There is no clinical, Survey, Immunization, family Welfare & National Health Programmes. No record is available. 24. There was no display of name of Dean outside his office</p>	<p>14. Interns' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet. Recreation room is not available. 15. Residents' Hostel: Computer in Study room is nonfunctional & does not have Internet. 16. Canteen: Although infrastructure is available, presently canteen services are not available. 17. RHTC: Details not provided. Faculty from Community Medicine were not present at time of visit. 18. UHC: Details not provided. Faculty from Community Medicine were not present at time of visit.</p>	<p>8. No Dissent note on assessor report which is signed by Dean/Principal Reply not satisfactory Deficiency persists. 9. -do- 10. -do- 11. - 12. --- 13. -Reply not satisfactory deficiency persists. 14. Reply not satisfactory deficiency persists. 15. Reply not satisfactory deficiency persists. 16. Reply not satisfactory deficiency persists. 17. Reply not satisfactory deficiency persists. 18. Reply not satisfactory deficiency persists.</p>	
---	--	--	--

Conclusion: Hearing Committee does not recommend Major SD Singh Medical College & Hospital for renewal/ recognition.





