

88

Annexure - I

**Ministry of Health and Family Welfare
Department of Family Welfare**

**Minutes of the Ninth Meeting of Central Supervisory Board constituted
under the Pre-conception and Pre-Natal Diagnostic Techniques
(Prohibition of Sex Selection) Act, 1994 held on 10-05-2003**

1. The list of participants is attached.
2. The participants welcomed the Hon'ble Minister for Health and Family Welfare who presided over the meeting.
3. Shri J.V.R Prasada Rao, Secretary, Department of Family Welfare, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare briefed the participants about the status and history of the Central Supervisory Board (CSB), statutory requirement of the meeting of the Board and the purpose of this meeting.
4. After brief introduction of the participants, the agenda for the meeting was taken up item-wise.
5. **Agenda Item No.1** (Confirmation of the Minutes of the last meeting of the Central Supervisory Board held on 8.10.2002)
6. Shri J.V.R Prasada Rao, Secretary, Department of Family Welfare placed before the board the minutes of the last meeting of the Board held on 8.10.2002 for confirmation. The Board confirmed the same. Thereafter, he appraised the Board about the action taken by Government on the decisions/recommendations made by the Board in the said meeting.
7. Thereafter, **Agenda Item No.2** and additional agenda item for laying down conditions for conducting pre-natal diagnostic techniques including ultrasonography on pregnant woman was discussed and it was felt that before arriving at a decision to notify the proposed conditions, the matter may be considered in detail by the Technical Committee headed by Dr. S.P. Agwaral, D.G.H.S.
8. Thereafter, **Agenda Item No. 3** relating to amendment of section 2(m) of the Act for permitting Homeopathic and Ayurvedic Doctors

having proper training to use/handle/conduct ultrasonography/image scanning techniques and accreditation/ recognition of institutions for imparting training in ultrasonography/image scanning was taken up for consideration. Smt. Malti Sinha, Secretary (ISM&H) stated that a proposal was submitted by Department of IMS & H for amendment of section 2(m) of the PNDT Act for permitting the Homeopathic and Ayurvedic Doctors to use ultrasonography for diagnosis and treatment, but the requisite amendment to the Act has not been carried out along with other amendments made to the Act recently. In this regard, Dr. S.P. Agarwal wanted to appraise the Board about the reasons for not exceeding to the request of Department of ISM&H. Hon'ble Minister felt that the issue may be examined in detail by the Technical Committee headed by DGHS in which representatives of Associations of doctors belonging to Ayurveda and Homeopathy may be specially invited.

9. Thereafter, Agenda Item No.4 i.e. Plan of Action for elimination of pre-conception sex selection and pre-natal determination/disclosure of sex of foetus (copy enclosed) was discussed and approved.

During the discussion, Ms. Urmila B. Apte and Dr. (Ms.) Deventla Singh stated that we should go into the root cause and factors like child marriage, lack of education of girls, dowry system, greed of Doctors etc. which are responsible for elimination of female foetus and girl children. Hon'ble Minister also felt that religious taboos and social practices like performance of last rites by sons or other male members of the family, offering of water to the deceased forefathers etc., are also responsible for the desires of Indian families to have at least one son. This leads to female foeticide or elimination of girls before/after birth. Secretary (FW) felt that law alone is not sufficient to uproot the social evil. There should be watchdogs in the society who should keep a vigilant eye on the perpetrators of female foeticide. Dr. Deventla Singh and other doctors stated that it is not possible for the doctors to complain about other doctors who are indulging in female foeticide. Dr. Suresh stated that there has been appreciable change in the attitude of people desiring abortions of female foetus. Number of such patients has come down considerably during the last one year. Law has had its impact. Dr. (Mrs.) Mehta advocated the need to include PNDT in medical curriculum. Dr. S.S. Aggarwal felt that there is a definite need to undertake research work for arriving at the line of action for eradication of this social evil. Dr. Urmila B. Apte stated that there is need

to inform the women undergoing multiple abortions for removal of female foetus that continuous abortions would adversely affect her health.

The Hon'ble Minister for Health and Family Welfare stated that she is very happy to hear the participants' concern about the social evil of elimination of female foetus and girl child, other social evils prevailing in the society and religious misgivings etc. Though, ultrasonography is a blessing of modern technological advances, yet it has proved to be curse on the females. It has led to elimination of females before birth. After the birth of a girl child, a mother may have mercy on her and save her. However, the use of ultrasonography has deprived the girl child even of that mercy. Law alone will not solve the problem, yet it is an instrument that helps to solve the problem. Attitudinal change in the society is absolutely necessary. Media publicity is necessary to change the social thinking. Religious leaders should be involved as their words and preaching are treated as binding law by the masses. Catchy slogans and posters having such slogans have a bearing. Slogans like, 'Kill me not, mother, I am your own' [माँ मुझे मत मारो, मैं तुम्हारी अपनी हूँ], on a poster showing a beautiful girl in the womb of a pregnant women displayed in a hospital/nursing home near the operation table, in operation theatre will have a definite impression on the pregnant lady who comes for abortion of female foetus. Celebrities and leaders have a definite role to play. Celebrities who have only daughter(s) should tell the society their experience of being happy with the daughters. The pleasure of bringing up a daughter is different. It is more delightful than the pleasure of bringing up a son. [बेटी को पालने का आनन्द ही अलग है, इससे वंचित मत होईये] Slogans like, 'If you practice female foeticide, your generations shall have to remain unmarried' [लड़कियां घटाओगे तो कुंवारे रह जाओगे], need to be brought out in electronic and print media.

She pointed out that the evil practice of elimination of girl child before or after birth is very deep-rooted in the society. Therefore, the task to eradicate this evil is very difficult, though not impossible. When we have attained elimination of 'sati system', 'untouchability' etc., we shall certainly be able to eliminate this social evil also. Continuous and concerted efforts are needed.

The meeting ended with vote of thanks to the chair.

P

List of Participants

1. Shrimati Sushma Swaraj, Minister for Health and Health & Family Welfare (Chairperson).
2. Dr. (Smt.) Rejeswaramma Vukkala, Member of Parliament (Lok Sabha), Buchireddypalem, Nellore District, Andhra Pradesh. 214, North Avenue, New Delhi-1 PhoneNo. 23093305, 08622272072.
3. Shri J.V.R. Prasada Rao, Secretary, Department of Family Welfare.
4. Smt. Malti S. Sinha, Secretary, Department of ISM & Homoeopathy, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Red Cross Building, New Delhi – 110001.
5. Dr. S.P. Aggarwal, Director General of Health Services, Ministry of Health and Family Welfare, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi.
6. Dr. K. Kalaivani, Prof. & Head of the Department of Reproductive & Bio-Medicine, National Institute of Health and Family Welfare, Munirka, New Delhi. [Ph.No.26165959 – E-mail kkalaivanik@yahoo.co.uk]
7. Dr. Shyam S. Agarwal, Director, Advanced Centre for Treatment, Research & Education in Cancer (ACTREC) TATA Memorial Centre, Kharghar, Navi Mumbai – 400208. [Ph. No.022 2741 2906/ 07; <syam_agarwal@vsnl.net>]
8. Dr. Ashok Kumar Datta, Prof. and Head of the Department of Paediatrics, Kalawati Saran Children's Hospital, Lady Hardinge Medical College, New Delhi. [Ph.No. 2336 5792(O), 23343273 (R) – FAX 23363396 duttaak@vsnl.net].
9. Dr. Urmila B. Apte, Organizing Secretary, Bhartiya Satree Shakti, 4, Girish, T.H. Kataria Marg, Mahim, Mumbai – 400016. [Ph.No.022 24376441].
10. Dr. Deventla Singh, FRCOG, Former Professor of Gynecology and Obstetrics, Patna Medical College & Hospital, Kadam Kuan, Near Budha Murti, Patna. [Tel.No.0162 2233519]
11. Dr.(Mrs.) A.K. Mehta, Director, Directorate of Family Welfare, Old SDA College Building, Malka Ganj, Delhi-110007 [Ph.No. 23964839]
12. Dr. S.S. Vaishya, DMHS, PHC Campus, Directorate of Health, Moti Daman, Daman & Diu. [Ph.No.0260 – 2230470, 2230847 Fax 0260-2230570]
13. Dr. D. Thamma Rao, Director, Health & Family Welfare, Pondicherry [Ph.No.0413-2337050 thammarao@hotmail.com]
14. Dr. S.K. Sharma, Advier (Ayurveda), Department of IMS&H, MOHFW. Phone: 23325876.
15. Shri M.K. Sharma, Deputy Legal Adviser, Department of Legal Affairs, Ministry of Law & Justice, Shastri Bhavan, New Delhi [Ph.No.23384831 (O) 26515591 (R)].
16. Dr. Vasantha Muthuswamy, Sr. DDG, ICMR, New Delhi [Ph.No.26589791 E-mail vmuthuswamy@hotmail.com]
17. Dr. Rakesh Mittal, Deputy Director General (SG), Indian Council of Medical Research (ICMR), Ansari Nagar, Post Box No.4911, New Delhi- 110029 [Ph.No. 26589493, 26558 9753 – FAX No.26581055].
18. Shri N.P. Ayyar, Eco. Adviser, Department of Women and Child Development, Ministry of HRD, Shastri Bhavan, New Delhi. [Ph.No.23383823 (O) – E-mail npayyar@hotmail.com]

19. Dr. Col. C.S. Pant, President, Indian Radiological and Imaging Association, IRIA House, C-5, Qutab Institutional Area, New Delhi - 110 016 [Ph.No.926858788 E-mail dr_pant@vsnl.net]
20. Dr. Vinay Aggarwal, Joint Secretary, Indian Medical Association [Phone No.9811050403 E-mail vinayaggar@yahoo.com]
21. Dr.K.K. Arora, Secretary I/C, MCI, New Delhi-2 [Tel.No.23232618, 23235178, 23236081, 23231371 E-mail mci@del3.vsnl.nct.in]
22. Dr. S. Suresh, Director, Mediscan Prenatal Diagnostic and Fetal Therapy Centre, 203, Avvai Shanmugham Road, Royapettah, Chennai-600014. [Ph.No.044-28116965 E-mail ssuresh@vsnl.com]
23. Dr. B.S. Dahiya, DGHS cum State Appropriate Authority, Haryana [0172584549]
24. Dr.(Mrs.) Saroj Dhingra, Assistant Commissioner, Department of Family Welfare, MoHFW.
25. Shri Yeshpal Dabas, Under Secreary, Department of WCD, New Delhi.[Ph.No.23382747].
26. Shri R.N. Bansal, Under Secretary, Department of Family Welfare, Nirman Bhavan, New Delhi-110011 [Ph.No.23019796 E-mail uspolicy@nb.nic.in].